

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**WHEELING**

**DAVID and ROXY VANCE,  
and CARLA SHULTZ individually  
and on behalf of a class of all  
persons and entities similarly situated,**

**Plaintiffs,**

**vs.**

**Case No. 5:17-cv-00179-JPB**

**DIRECTV, LLC,**

**Defendant.**

**PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND SERVICE AWARDS**

For the reasons stated in the accompanying memorandum, Plaintiffs David Vance, Roxie Vance, and Carla Shultz move the Court for an order granting an award of attorneys' fees of \$5,616,666, litigation costs of \$330,975, and service awards of \$10,000 to each of the three Plaintiffs.

Dated: June 22, 2023

Respectfully Submitted,

BAILEY & GLASSER LLP

By: /s/ John W. Barrett  
John W. Barrett  
**BAILEY & GLASSER LLP**  
209 Capitol Street  
Charleston, West Virginia 25301  
(304) 345-6555  
(304) 342-1110 (fax)  
jbarrett@baileyglasser.com

Matthew P. McCue  
**The Law Office of Matthew P. McCue**  
1 South Ave., Third Floor

Natick, MA 01760  
Telephone: (508) 655-1415  
[mmcuez@massattorneys.net](mailto:mmcuez@massattorneys.net)

Edward A. Broderick  
**BRODERICK LAW, P.C.**  
176 Federal Street, Fifth Floor  
Boston, MA 02110  
Telephone: (617) 738-7089  
[ted@broderick-law.com](mailto:ted@broderick-law.com)

Anthony I. Paronich  
**PARONICH LAW, P.C.**  
350 Lincoln Street, Suite 2400  
Hingham, MA 02043  
(508) 221-1510  
[anthony@paronichlaw.com](mailto:anthony@paronichlaw.com)

*Class Counsel for Plaintiffs*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on June 22, 2023, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

By: s/ John W. Barrett  
John W. Barrett  
**BAILEY & GLASSER LLP**  
209 Capitol Street  
Charleston, WV 25301  
Telephone: (304) 345-6555  
jbarrett@baileyglasser.com

# EXHIBIT 1

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**Wheeling Division**

**DAVID and ROXIE VANCE and  
CARLA SHULTZ, individually  
and on behalf of a class of all  
persons and entities similarly situated,**

**Plaintiffs,**

**vs.**

**Case No. 5:17-cv-00179-JPB**

**DIRECTV, LLC,**

**Defendant.**

**DECLARATION OF JOHN W. BARRETT IN SUPPORT OF  
MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS**

1. I am a partner at Bailey & Glasser LLP. I have served as the firm's President and head of our contingent practice, so I am very familiar with our firm's time and expense tracking, and with our hourly rates, including hourly rates used to determine lodestar for attorneys' fee crosscheck purposes. I have served as one of the lead counsel for the Plaintiffs in this case.

2. I have extensive class action experience. I have handled and won class action, mass action, and individual plaintiff jury trials in federal and state court, and successfully argued appeals to uphold verdicts won in those cases. My firm has the resources to fund and prosecute this case to a successful conclusion. Some of my cases include:

- *Krakauer v. Dish Network, L.L.C.*, No. 1:14-cv-00333, M.D. N.C. (five-day TCPA jury trial and a treble damages award for a certified class, resulting in \$61.3 million judgment, *affirmed* 925 F.3d 643 (4<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2019));
- *Hankins v. Alarm.com Incorporated and Alarm.com Holdings, Inc.*, No. 4:15-cv-06314, N.D. Cal. (settled TCPA class action for \$28 million);
- *In re Monitronics TCPA Litig.*, MDL No. 2493, N.D. W.Va. (appointed MDL Co-Lead Counsel; \$28 million TCPA class action settlement);
- *Mey v. Patriot Payment Group, LLC*, No. 5:15-cv-00027, N.D. W.Va. (\$3.7 million

settlement in TCPA class action);

- *Mey v. Venture Data, LLC*, No. 5:14-cv-00123, N.D. W. Va. (\$2.1 million TCPA class action settlement);
- *Mey v. Frontier Communications Corp.*, No. 3:13-01191, D. Conn. (\$11 million nationwide TCPA settlement);
- *Generic Drug Litigation (State of West Va. v. Rite Aid of West Va.*, No. 09-C-27; and *State of West Va. v. CVS Pharmacy, Inc.*, No. 09-C-226 (Circuit Court of Boone County, West Virginia) (as Special Assistant Attorney General, won settlements of more than \$10 million in *parens patriae* consumer protection litigation);
- *Carter v. Forjas Taurus SA et al.*, No. 1:13-CV-24583, S.D. Fla. (class counsel for product liability class action against Brazilian pistol manufacturer; settlement provides for the free exchange of defective pistols for new pistols (unlimited by any claims period), or cash payments of up to \$30 million for returned pistols; total value of settlement \$240 million);
- *Desai v. ADT Security*, No. 11-C-1925, N.D. Ill. (\$15 million TCPA settlement for nationwide class);

3. I believe the \$16,850,000 settlement in this case is truly outstanding. While the precise amount is not yet known, if 20% of class members submit valid claims, and if the Court awards the requested attorneys' fees and costs, the average cash payment to claiming class members will be \$460. There are 113,997 class members, and they received a total of 324,943 calls. Every class member received at least two calls, and some received more. The average class member received 2.85 calls.

4. Class Counsel have received no payment for their fees and costs. Since beginning work on this case my firm worked with no guarantee of being compensated for its time and efforts. Payment of my fees has always been contingent on successfully obtaining relief for the Plaintiffs and class members. As a result, there was a substantial risk of non-payment, particularly in light of the legal challenges involved in litigating this case. Work on this case has necessarily been to the exclusion of work on other matters that likely would have generated fees. I have also been denied use of the fees it earned over the course of this case.

5. The lodestar does not include the work Class Counsel will do after completion of this motion, which will include working with the settlement administrator, preparing the motion for final approval and attending the hearing, and communicating with class members.

6. My firm spent 3,135.25 hours in attorney and paralegal time on this case, yielding a lodestar of \$1,612,707.50. I am familiar with the billing rates for attorneys and paralegals with similar experience, particularly with expertise in matters arising under the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. § 227, *et seq.* and my firm's billing rates are reasonable and consistent with the rates of attorneys and paralegals of similar experience and qualification, and have been used by us in other cases, both contingent and hourly.

7. Our reasonable and necessary costs for items including court fees, expert witness services (\$74,944.28), appellate counsel fees to Gupta Wessler, PLLC and Hissam Forman Donovan Ritchie, PLLC for work on DirecTV's multiple appeals (\$41,666), transcripts, document hosting, travel, lodging, and mediation fees, total \$176,433.25.

8. As is attested to by the declarations submitted by my co-counsel, collectively, Class Counsel spent 4,997.75 attorney and paralegal hours, yielding a lodestar of \$3,020,362.50. Class Counsel's collective total costs were \$330,975, in line with the anticipated costs of approximately \$300,000 referenced in the Notice.

9. Each Plaintiff devoted significant time to this action, assisting us in developing the facts underlying the amended complaint in this action, making their initial disclosures, responding to request for documents, and answering interrogatories. Each Plaintiff sat for a deposition, and each was prepared to attend trial should the case have proceeded to trial. Without their willingness to file suit, no recovery would have been possible.

PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I DECLARE SIGNED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA THAT THE FOREGOING IS TRUE AND CORRECT EXECUTED THIS THIS 22nd DAY OF JUNE, 2023

*/s/ John W. Barrett*  
John W. Barrett



# EXHIBIT 2

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**Wheeling Division**

**DAVID and ROXIE VANCE and  
CARLA SHULTZ, individually  
and on behalf of a class of all  
persons and entities similarly situated,**

**Plaintiffs,**

**vs.**

**Case No. 5:17-cv-00179-JPB**

**DIRECTV, LLC,**

**Defendant.**

**Declaration of Matthew P. McCue in Support of Motion for  
Attorneys' Fees, Costs and Incentive Awards**

I, Matthew P. McCue, declare under penalty of perjury:

1. I am an attorney duly admitted to practice in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, I am over 18 years of age and I am competent to testify and make this affidavit on personal knowledge. I make this declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Expenses and Incentive Awards. In this declaration I will describe the work that I and my co-counsel have done in identifying and investigating potential claims in the action and to set forth my qualifications to serve as class counsel, and describe my experience in representing plaintiff classes in class actions, and cases brought under the 47 U.S.C. § 227, the Telephone Consumer Protection Act. ("TCPA").

2. I was involved in every stage of representing Plaintiffs in this case, from pre-trial investigation, analysis of Plaintiffs' potential claims, and review of documents and discovery responses, depositions, work on DirecTV's four appeals in the case, mediation and settlement negotiations, as well as moving for preliminary approval.

3. Class Counsel have received no payment for their fees and costs. Since beginning work on this case I worked with no guarantee of being compensated for my time and effort. Payment of my fees has always been contingent on successfully obtaining relief for the Plaintiffs and class members. As a result, there was a substantial risk of non-payment, particularly in light of the legal challenges involved in litigating this case. Work on this case has necessarily been to the exclusion of work on other matters that likely would have generated fees. I have also been denied use of the fees it earned over the course of this case.

4. I have spent 980 hours prosecuting Plaintiffs' claims. Billed at my current hourly rate of \$800, my hours yield a lodestar of \$784,000. I am familiar with the billing rates for attorneys with similar experience, particularly with expertise in matters arising under the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. § 227, *et seq.* and my billing rate is reasonable and consistent with the rates of attorneys of similar experience and qualification. My firm additionally expended \$88,864.90 in reasonable and necessary expenses in the litigation, including \$26,666 to appellate counsel Gupta Wessler, PLLC for work on DirecTV's multiple appeals and \$53,228.24 in expert fees. My lodestar does not include the work I will do after completion of this motion.

5. Based on my experience in prosecuting class actions under the TCPA, I believe this settlement represents an excellent result for the class and that Plaintiffs' request for attorneys' fees, expenses and incentive awards is reasonable and should be approved by the Court.

#### **QUALIFICATIONS OF COUNSEL**

6. I am a 1993 honors graduate of Suffolk Law School in Boston, Massachusetts. Following graduation from law school, I served as a law clerk to the Justices of the Massachusetts Superior Court. I then served a second year as a law clerk for the Hon. F. Owen Eagan, United States Magistrate Judge for the USDC District of Connecticut.

7. In 1994, I was admitted to the Bar in Massachusetts. Since then, I have been admitted to practice before the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts, the First Circuit Court of Appeals, the United States District Court for the District of Colorado, the Sixth Circuit Court of Appeals and the United States Supreme Court.

8. Following my clerkships, I was employed as a litigation associate with the Boston law firm of Hanify & King. In 1997, I joined the law firm of Mirick O'Connell as a litigation associate where I focused my trial and appellate practice on Plaintiffs' personal injury and consumer protection law.

9. In the summer of 2002, I was recognized by the legal publication Massachusetts Lawyers Weekly as one of five "Up and Coming Attorneys" for my work on behalf of consumers and accident victims.

10. In November of 2004, I started my own law firm focusing exclusively on the litigation of consumer class actions and serious personal injury cases.

11. I am in good standing in every court to which I am admitted to practice.

12. A sampling of other class actions in which I have represented classes of consumers follows:

- i. Mey v. Herbalife International, Inc., USDC, D. W. Va., Civil Action, No. 01-C-263M. Co-lead counsel with Attorney Broderick and additional co-counsel, prosecuting consumer class action pursuant to TCPA on behalf of nationwide class of junk fax and prerecorded telephone solicitation recipients. \$7,000,000 class action settlement preliminarily approved on July 6, 2007 and granted final approval on February 5, 2008.
- ii. Mulhern v. MacLeod d/b/a ABC Mortgage Company, Norfolk Superior Court, 2005-01619 (Donovan, J.). Representing class of Massachusetts consumers who received unsolicited facsimile advertisements in violation of the TCPA and G.L. c. 93A. The case was certified as a class action, and I was appointed co-lead counsel, with Attorney Edward Broderick by the Court on February 17, 2006, settlement for \$475,000 granted final approval by the Court on July 25, 2007.
- iii. Evan Fray-Witzer, v. Metropolitan Antiques, LLC, NO. 02-5827 Business Session, (Van Gestel, J.). In this case, the defendant filed two Motions to Dismiss challenging the

Plaintiffs' right to pursue a private right of action and challenging the statute at issue as violative of the telemarketer's First Amendment rights. Both Motions to Dismiss were denied. Class certification was then granted and I was appointed co-lead class counsel. Companion to this litigation, my co-counsel and I successfully litigated the issue of whether commercial general liability insurance provided coverage for the alleged illegal telemarketing at issue. We ultimately appealed this issue to the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court which issued a decision reversing the contrary decision of the trial court and finding coverage. See Terra Nova Insurance v. Fray-Witzer et al., 449 Mass. 206 (2007). This case resolved for \$1,800,000.

- iv. Shonk Land Company, LLC v. SG Sales Company, Circuit Court of Kanawha County, West Virginia, Civil Action No. 07-C-1800 (multi-state class action on behalf of recipients of faxes in violation of TCPA, settlement for \$2,450,000, final approval granted in September of 2009.
- v. Mann & Company, P.C. v. C-Tech Industries, Inc., USDC, D. Mass., C.A. 1:08CV11312-RGS, class action on behalf of recipients of faxes in violation of TCPA, settlement for \$1,000,000, final approval granted in January of 2010.
- vi. Evan Fray Witzer v. Olde Stone Land Survey Company, Inc., Massachusetts Superior Court, Civil Action No. 08-04165 (February 3, 2011) (final approval granted for TCPA class settlement). This matter settled for \$1,300,000.
- vii. Milford & Ford Associates, Inc. and D. Michael Collins vs. Cell-Tek, LLC, USDC, D. Mass. C. A. 1:09-cv- 11261-DPW, class action on behalf of recipients of faxes in violation of TCPA, settlement for \$1,800,000, final approval granted August 17, 2011 (Woodlock, J.)
- viii. Collins v. Locks & Keys of Woburn Inc., Massachusetts Superior Court, Civil Action No. 07-4207-BLS2 (December 14, 2011) (final approval granted for TCPA class settlement). This matter settled for \$2,000,000.
- ix. Brey Corp t/a Hobby Works v. Life Time Pavers, Inc., Circuit Court for Montgomery County, Maryland, Civil Action No. 349410-V. This matter settled for \$1,575,000.
- x. Collins, et al v. ACS, Inc. et al, USDC, District of Massachusetts, Civil Action No. 10-CV-11912 a TCPA case for illegal fax advertising, which settled for \$1,875,000.
- xi. Desai and Charvat v. ADT Security Services, Inc., USDC, Northern District of Illinois, Civil Action No. 11-CV-1925, settlement of \$15,000,000, approved, awarding fees of one third of common fund.
- xii. Benzion v. Vivint, 0:12cv61826, USDC S.D.Fla., settlement of \$6,000,000 granted final approval in February of 2015.
- xiii. Kensington Physical Therapy v. Jackson Physical Therapy Partners, USDC, District of Maryland, 8:11cv02467, settlement of \$4,500,000 granted final approval in February of 2015.

- xiv. Jay Clogg Realty v. Burger King Corp., USDC, District of Maryland, 8:13cv00662, settlement of \$8.5 million granted final approval in May of 2015.
- xv. Charvat v. AEP Energy, 1:14cv03121 ND Ill, class settlement of \$6 million granted final approval on September 28, 2015.
- xvi. Mey v. Interstate National Dealer Services, Inc., USDC, ND. Ga., 1:14-cv-01846-ELR, TCPA class settlement of \$4,200,000 granted final approval on June 8, 2016.
- xvii. Philip Charvat and Ken Johansen v. National Guardian Life Insurance Company, USDC, WD. WI., 15-cv-43-JDP, TCPA class settlement for \$1,500,000 granted final approval on August 4, 2016.
- xviii. Thomas Krakauer v. Dish Network, L.L.C., USDC, MDNC, Civil Action No. 1:14-CV-333 on September 9, 2015. I was co-trial counsel in the case which resulted in a jury verdict in favor of plaintiff and the class of \$20,446,400 on January 19, 2017. (Dkt. 292). On May 22, 2017, this amount was trebled by the Court after finding that Dish Network's violations were "willful or knowing", for a revised damages award of \$61,339,200. (Dkt. No. 338). Affirmed on appeal, *Krakauer v. Dish Network, LLC*, 925 F.3d 643 (4<sup>th</sup> Cir. May 20, 2019), *cert. denied. Dish Network, L.L.C. v. Krakauer*, 140 S.Ct. 676 (December 16, 2019).
- xix. Dr. Charles Shulruff, D.D.S. v. Inter-med, Inc., 1:16-cv-00999, ND Ill, class settlement of \$400,000 granted final approval on November 22, 2016.
- xx. Toney v. Quality Resources, Inc., Cheryl Mercuris and Sempris LLC, 13-cv-00042, in which a TCPA class settlement was granted final approval on December 1, 2016 with TCPA settlement in the amount of \$2,150,00 with one of three defendants an assignment of rights against defendant's insurance carrier. Second settlement of \$3,300,000 granted final approval on September 25, 2018.
- xxi. Bull v. US Coachways, Inc., 1:14-cv-05789, settlement distributing \$3,250,000 approved on May 18, 2019.
- xxii. Smith v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co., et. al., USDC, ND. Ill., 1:13-cv-02018, TCPA class settlement of \$7,000,000.00 granted final approval on December 8, 2016.
- xxiii. Mey v. Frontier Communications Corporation, USDC, D. Ct., 3:13-cv-1191-MPS, a TCPA class settlement of \$11,000,000 granted final approval on June 2, 2017.
- xxiv. Biringer v. First Family Insurance, Inc., USDC, ND. Fla., a TCPA class settlement of \$2,900,000 granted final approval on April 24, 2017.
- xxv. Abramson v. Alpha Gas and Electric, LLC, USDC, SD. NY., 7:15-cv-05299-KMK, a TCPA class settlement of \$1,100,000 granted final approval on May 3, 2017.

- xxvi. Heidarpour v. Central Payment Co., USDC, MD. Ga., 16-cv-01215, a TCPA class settlement of \$6,500,000 granted final approval on May 4, 2017.
- xxvii. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. New York Life Insurance Company, USDC, SD. NY., 1:16-cv-03588-BCM, a TCPA class settlement of \$3,250,000 granted final approval on February 27, 2018.
- xxviii. Abramson v. CWS Apartment Home, LLC, USDC, WD. Tex., 16-cv-01215, a TCPA class settlement of \$368,000.00 granted final approval on May 19, 2017.
- xxix. Charvat v. Elizabeth Valente, et al, USDC, NDIL, 1:12-cv-05746, \$12,500,000 TCPA settlement granted final approval on November 4, 2019, appeal pending.
- xxx. Mey v. Got Warranty, Inc., et. al., USDC, NDWV., 5:15-cv-00101-JPB-JES, a TCPA class settlement of \$650,000 granted final approval on July 26, 2017.
- xxxi. Mey v. Patriot Payment Group, LLC, USDC, NDWV., 5:15-cv-00027-JPB-JES, a TCPA class settlement of \$3,700,000 granted final approval on July 26, 2017.
- xxxii. Charvat and Wheeler v. Plymouth Rock Energy, LLC, et al, USDC, EDNY, 2:15-cv-04106-JMA-SIL, a TCPA class settlement of \$1,675,000 granted final approval on July 31, 2018.
- xxxiii. Fulton Dental, LLC v. Bisco, Inc., USDC, NDIL, 1:15-cv-11038. TCPA class settlement for \$262,500 granted final approval on March 7, 2018.
- xxxiv. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Birch Communications, Inc., USDC, NDGA, 1:15-cv-03262-AT. TCPA class settlement of \$12,000,000 granted final approval on December 14, 2017.
- xxxv. Mey v. Venture Data, LLC and Public Opinion Strategies, USD NDWV, 5:14-cv-123. Final approval of TCPA settlement granted on September 8, 2018.
- xxxvi. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Alarm.com, Inc., USDC, NDCA 4:15-cv-06314-YGR. TCPA class settlement of \$28,000,000 granted final approval on August 15, 2019.
- xxxvii. In Re Monitronics International, Inc. Telephone Consumer Protection Act Litigation, USDC, NDWV, 1:13-md-02493-JPB-MJA, a TCPA class settlement of \$28,000,000 granted final approval on June 12, 2018.
- xxxviii. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Allstate Insurance Company, et al, USDC, NDIL 1:15-cv-00925. TCPA class settlement of \$10,500,000 granted final approval on August 15, 2019.
- xxxix. Kaiser v. CVS Pharmacy, Inc., et al, USDC NDIL, 1:14-cv-03687, TCPA class settlement of \$15,000,000 approved on January 30, 2020.

PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I DECLARE SIGNED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA THAT THE FOREGOING IS TRUE AND CORRECT EXECUTED THIS THIS 22nd DAY OF JUNE 2023 IN THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS.

/s/ Matthew P. McCue  
Matthew P. McCue



# EXHIBIT 3

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**Wheeling Division**

**DAVID and ROXIE VANCE and  
CARLA SHULTZ, individually  
and on behalf of a class of all  
persons and entities similarly situated,**

**Plaintiffs,**

**vs.**

**Case No. 5:17-cv-00179-JPB**

**DIRECTV, LLC,**

**Defendant.**

**DECLARATION OF EDWARD A. BRODERICK**

I, Edward A. Broderick, declare as follows:

1. I am an attorney duly admitted to practice in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, I am over 18 years of age, am competent to testify and make this affidavit on personal knowledge. I make this declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Costs and Service Awards. In this declaration I will describe the work that I and my co-counsel have done in identifying and investigating potential claims in the action and set forth my qualifications. I will also describe my experience in representing plaintiff classes in class actions brought under the 47 U.S.C. § 227, the Telephone Consumer Protection Act. ("TCPA").

2. I have been involved in every stage of representing Plaintiffs in this case, from pre-trial investigation, analysis of Plaintiffs' potential claims, witness interviews, review of documents and discovery responses as well as depositions, motion practice, oral arguments, work on the four appeals filed in this action by DirecTV, mediation and settlement negotiations.

3. In my experience litigating cases under the TCPA, the Settlement in this case represents an excellent result for the class, and merits final approval from the Court.

4. Plaintiffs David and Roxie Vance and Carla Schultz devoted significant time to this action, assisting their counsel in developing the facts underlying the amended complaint in this action, as well as making their initial disclosures, responding to request for documents (and producing those documents) as well as answering interrogatories. Plaintiff all sat for depositions in the action. Without Plaintiffs' efforts both in documenting the source of the telemarketing in this action and their willingness to file suit, no recovery would have been possible.

5. Class Counsel have received no payment for their fees and costs. Since beginning work on this case my firm worked with no guarantee of being compensated for its time and efforts. Payment of my fees has always been contingent on successfully obtaining relief for the Plaintiffs and class members. As a result, there was a substantial risk of non-payment, particularly in light of the legal challenges involved in litigating this case. Work on this case has necessarily been to the exclusion of work on other matters that likely would have generated fees. I have also been denied use of the fees it earned over the course of this case.

6. The lodestar does not include the work Class Counsel will do after completion of this motion, which will include working with the settlement administrator, preparing the motion for final approval and attending the hearing, and communicating with class members.

7. My firm spent 603.7 attorney hours prosecuting Plaintiffs' claims. Billed at my hourly rate of \$800 and \$550 for Mr. Paronich for the portion of the case when he was a partner in my firm (my Paronich is also attesting to his hours spent after his departure from my firm in a separate declaration), my firms hours yield a lodestar of \$472,385. I am familiar with the billing rates for attorneys with similar experience, particularly with expertise in matters arising under the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. § 227, *et seq.* and my billing rate and that is reasonable and is consistent with the rates of attorneys of similar experience and qualification. My firm additionally incurred \$64,294.85 in reasonable and necessary expenses in the litigation,

including expert witness charges of \$18,438.22, deposition expenses, travel, appellate counsel fees to Gupta Wessler of \$26,668, mediator fees and court charges.

### QUALIFICATIONS OF COUNSEL

8. I am a 1993 graduate of Harvard Law School. Following graduation from law school, I served as a law clerk to the Honorable Martin L.C. Feldman, United States District Judge in the Eastern District of Louisiana.

9. Following my clerkship, from 1994 to December 1996, I was an associate in the litigation department of Ropes & Gray in Boston, where I gained class action experience in the defense of a securities class action, *Schaeffer v. Timberland*, in the United States District Court in New Hampshire, and participated in many types of complex litigation.

10. From January 1997 to March 2000, I was an associate with Ellis & Rapacki, a three-lawyer Boston firm focused on the representation of consumers in class actions.

11. In March 2000, I co-founded the firm of Shlansky & Broderick, LLP, focusing my practice on complex litigation and the representation of consumers.

12. In 2003, I started my own law firm focusing exclusively on the litigation consumer class actions.

13. A sampling of other class actions in which I have represented classes of consumers and been appointed class counsel follows:

- i. *In re General Electric Capital Corp. Bankruptcy Debtor Reaffirmation Agreements Litigation*, (MDL Docket No. 1192) (N.D. Ill) (nationwide class action challenging reaffirmation practices of General Electric Capital Corporation, settlement worth estimated \$60,000,000.)
- ii. *Hurley v. Federated Department Stores, Inc., et al*, USDC D. Mass. Civil Action No. 97-11479-NG (nationwide class action challenged bankruptcy reaffirmation practices of Federated Department Stores and others; \$8,000,000 recovery for class.)

- iii. *Valerie Ciardi v. F. Hoffman LaRoche, et al*, Middlesex Superior Court Civil Action No. 99-3244D, (class action pursuant to Massachusetts Consumer Protection Act, M.G.L. c. 93A brought on behalf of Massachusetts consumers harmed by price-fixing conspiracy by manufactures of vitamins; settled for \$19,600,000.)
- iv. *Shelah Feiss v. Mediaone Group, Inc, et al*, USDC N. District Georgia, Civil Action No. 99-CV-1170, (multistate class action on behalf of consumers; estimated class recovery of \$15,000,000--\$20,000,000.)
- v. *Mey v. Herbalife International, Inc.*, Ohio County Circuit Court (West Virginia), Civil Action No. 01-cv-263. \$7,000,000 TCPA class action settlement granted final approval on February 5, 2008 following the grant of a contested class certification motion.
- vi. *Mulhern v. MacLeod d/b/a ABC Mortgage Company*, Norfolk Superior Court (Massachusetts), Civil Action No. 05-01619-BLS. TCPA class settlement of \$475,000 following the grant of a contested class certification motion, granted final approval by the Court on July 25, 2007.
- vii. *Evan Fray-Witzer, v. Metropolitan Antiques, LLC*, Suffolk Superior Court (Massachusetts), Civil Action No. 02-5827-BLS. After the grant of a contested class certification motion, a companion case went to the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court, which issued a decision finding insurance coverage. *See Terra Nova Insurance v. Fray-Witzer et. al.*, 449 Mass. 206 (2007). There was then a TCPA class settlement of \$1,800,000 which was granted final approval.
- viii. *Shonk Land Company, LLC v. SG Sales Company*, Circuit Court of Kanswaha County (West Virginia), Civil Action No. 07-C-1800 TCPA class settlement for \$2,450,000, final approval granted in September of 2009.
- ix. *Mann & Company, P.C. v. C-Tech Industries, Inc.*, USDC, D. Mass., Civil Action No. 1:08-CV-11312-RGS, TCPA class settlement of \$1,000,000, final approval granted in January of 2010.
- x. *Evan Fray Witzer v. Olde Stone Land Survey Company, Inc.*, Suffolk Superior Court (Massachusetts), Civil Action No. 08-04165. TCPA class settlement \$1,300,000 granted final approval on February 3, 2011.
- xi. *Milford & Ford Associates, Inc. and D. Michael Collins vs. Cell-Tek, LLC*, USDC, D. Mass., Civil Action No. 1:09-cv-11261-DPW. TCPA class settlement of \$1,800,000, final approval granted August 17, 2011.
- xii. *Collins v. Locks & Keys of Woburn, Inc.*, Suffolk Superior Court (Massachusetts), Civil Action No. 07-4207-BLS2, TCPA class settlement of \$2,000,000 following the granting of a contested class certification motion, granted final approval on December 14, 2011.
- xiii. *Brey Corp t/a Hobby Works v. Life Time Pavers, Inc.*, Circuit Court for Montgomery

County (Maryland), Civil Action No. 349410-V, TCPA class settlement of \$1,575,000 granted final approval in March of 2012.

- xiv. *Collins, et al v. ACS, Inc. et al*, USDC, D. Mass., Civil Action No. 10-CV-11912, TCPA class settlement \$1,875,000 granted final approval on September 25, 2012.
- xv. *Desai and Charvat v. ADT Security Services, Inc.*, USDC, ND. Ill., Civil Action No. 11-CV-1925, TCPA class settlement of \$15,000,000 granted final approval on June 21, 2013.
- xvi. *Benzion v. Vivint*, 0:12cv61826, USDC S.D.Fla., settlement of \$6,000,000 granted final approval in February of 2015.
- xvii. *Kensington Physical Therapy, Inc. v. Jackson Therapy Partners, LLC*, USDC, D. MD, Civil Action No. 11-CV-02467, TCPA class settlement of \$4,500,000 granted final approval on February 12, 2015.
- xviii. *Jay Clogg Realty Group, Inc. v. Burger King Corporation*, USDC, D. MD., Civil Action No. 13-cv-00662, TCPA class settlement of \$8,500,000 granted final approval on April 15, 2015.
- xix. *Charvat v. AEP Energy, Inc.*, USDC, ND. Ill., 1:14-cv-03121, TCPA class settlement of \$6,000,000 granted final approval on September 28, 2015.
- xx. *Mey v. Interstate National Dealer Services, Inc.*, USDC, ND. Ga., 1:14-cv-01846-ELR, TCPA class settlement of \$4,200,000 granted final approval on June 8, 2016.
- xxi. *Philip Charvat and Ken Johansen v. National Guardian Life Insurance Company*, USDC, WD. WI., 15-cv-43-JDP, TCPA class settlement for \$1,500,000 granted final approval on August 4, 2016.
- xxii. *Bull v. US Coachways, Inc.*, USDC, ND. Ill., 1:14-cv-05789, TCPA class settlement finally approved on November 11, 2016 with an agreement for judgment in the amount of \$49,932,375 and an assignment of rights against defendant's insurance carrier.
- xxiii. *Toney v. Quality Resources, Inc., Cheryl Mercuris and Sempris LLC, et al.*, USDC, ND. Ill., 1:13-cv-00042, TCPA class settlement of \$2,150,000 was granted final approval on December 1, 2016 with one of three defendants, and an assignment of rights against defendant's insurance carrier. Second settlement on behalf of class against two remaining defendants of \$3,300,000 granted final approval on September 25, 2018.
- xxiv. *Smith v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co., et al.*, USDC, ND. Ill., 1:13-cv-02018, TCPA class settlement of \$7,000,000.00 granted final approval on December 8, 2016.
- xxv. *Mey v. Frontier Communications Corporation*, USDC, D. Ct., 3:13-cv-1191-MPS, a

TCPA class settlement of \$11,000,000 granted final approval on June 2, 2017.

- xxvi. *Biringer v. First Family Insurance, Inc.*, USDC, ND. Fla., a TCPA class settlement of \$2,900,000 granted final approval on April 24, 2017.
- xxvii. *Abramson v. Alpha Gas and Electric, LLC*, USDC, SD. NY., 7:15-cv-05299-KMK, a TCPA class settlement of \$1,100,000 granted final approval on May 3, 2017.
- xxviii. *Heidarpour v. Central Payment Co.*, USDC, MD. Ga., 16-cv-01215, a TCPA class settlement of \$6,500,000 granted final approval on May 4, 2017.
- xxix. *Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. New York Life Insurance Company*, USDC, SD. NY., 1:16-cv-03588-BCM, a TCPA class settlement of \$3,250,000 granted final approval on February 27, 2018.
- xxx. *Abramson v. CWS Apartment Home, LLC*, USDC, WD. Tex., 16-cv-01215, a TCPA class settlement of \$368,000.00 granted final approval on May 19, 2017.
- xxxi. *Charvat v. Elizabeth Valente, et al*, USDC, NDIL, 1:12-cv-05746, \$12,500,000 TCPA settlement granted final approval on November 4, 2019, appeal pending.
- xxxii. *Thomas Krakauer v. Dish Network, L.L.C.*, USDC MDNC, Civil Action No. 1:14-CV-333 on September 9, 2015. Following a contested class certification motion, this case went to trial in January of 2017 returning a verdict of \$20,446,400. On May 22, 2017, this amount was trebled by the Court after finding that Dish Network's violations were "willful or knowing", for a revised damages award of \$61,339,200. (Dkt. No. 338). Affirmed on appeal, *Krakauer v. Dish Network, LLC*, 925 F.3d 643 (4<sup>th</sup> Cir. May 20, 2019), *cert. denied. Dish Network, L.L.C. v. Krakauer*, 140 S.Ct. 676 (December 16, 2019).
- xxxiii. *Mey v. Got Warranty, Inc., et. al.*, USDC, NDWV., 5:15-cv-00101-JPB-JES, a TCPA class settlement of \$650,000 granted final approval on July 26, 2017.
- xxxiv. *Mey v. Patriot Payment Group, LLC*, USDC, NDWV., 5:15-cv-00027-JPB-JES, a TCPA class settlement of \$3,700,000 granted final approval on July 26, 2017.
- xxxv. *Charvat and Wheeler v. Plymouth Rock Energy, LLC*, et al, USDC, EDNY, 2:15-cv-04106-JMA-SIL, a TCPA class settlement of \$1,675,000 granted final approval on July 31, 2018.
- xxxvi. *Fulton Dental, LLC v. Bisco, Inc.*, USDC, NDIL, 1:15-cv-11038. TCPA class settlement for \$262,500 granted final approval on March 7, 2018
- xxxvii. *Mey v. Venture Data, LLC and Public Opinion Strategies*, USDC, NDWV, 5:14-cv-123. Final approval of TCPA settlement granted on September 8, 2018.
- xxxviii. *In Re Monitronics International, Inc. Telephone Consumer Protection Act Litigation*, USDC, NDWV, 1:13-md-02493-JPB-MJA, a TCPA class settlement of \$28,000,000

granted final approval on June 12, 2018.

- xxxix. *Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Alarm.com, Inc.*, USDC, NDCA 4:15-cv-06314-YGR. TCPA class settlement of \$28,000,000 granted final approval on August 15, 2019.
- xl. *Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Allstate Insurance Company, et al*, USDC, NDIL 1:15-cv-00925. TCPA class settlement of \$10,500,000 granted final approval on August 15, 2019.
- xli. *Kaiser v. CVS Pharmacy, Inc., et al*, USDC NDIL, 1:14-cv-03687, TCPA class settlement of \$15,000,000 approved on January 30, 2020.

PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I DECLARE SIGNED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA THAT THE FOREGOING IS TRUE AND CORRECT EXECUTED THIS 22<sup>h</sup> DAY OF JUNE, 2023 IN THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS.

/s/ Edward A. Broderick  
Edward A. Broderick



# EXHIBIT 4

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR  
THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA**

**Wheeling Division**

**DAVID and ROXIE VANCE and  
CARLA SHULTZ, individually  
and on behalf of a class of all  
persons and entities similarly situated,**

**Plaintiffs,**

**vs.**

**Case No. 5:17-cv-00179-JPB**

**DIRECTV, LLC,**

**Defendant.**

**DECLARATION OF ANTHONY I. PARONICH**

Anthony I. Paronich declares as follows:

1. I make this declaration in support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Attorneys' Fees, Costs and Service Awards.

2. I am an attorney duly admitted to practice in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, I am over 18 years of age, and I am competent to testify and make this affidavit on personal knowledge. I have extensive experience in the prosecution of class actions on behalf of consumers, particularly claims under the TCPA.

3. I have been involved in every stage of representing Plaintiffs in this case, from pre-trial investigation, analysis of Plaintiffs' potential claims, witness interviews, review of documents and discovery responses as well as depositions, motion practice, oral arguments and work on the four appeals filed in this action by DirecTV.

4. Class Counsel have received no payment for their fees and costs. Since opening my firm in March 2019 and continuing my work on this case, my firm worked with no guarantee of being compensated for its time and efforts. Payment of my fees has always been contingent on successfully obtaining relief for the Plaintiffs and class members. As a result, there was a substantial

risk of non-payment, particularly in light of the legal challenges involved in litigating this case. Work on this case has necessarily been to the exclusion of work on other matters that likely would have generated fees. I have also been denied use of the fees it earned over the course of this case.

5. The lodestar does not include the work Class Counsel will do after completion of this motion, which will include working with the settlement administrator, preparing the motion for final approval and attending the hearing, and communicating with class members.

6. My firm spent 277.8 attorney hours prosecuting Plaintiffs' claims (my hours spent on the case at my prior firm are reflected in the lodestar attested to by Edward Broderick of Broderick Law, P.C). Billed at my hourly rate of \$650, my firm's hours yield a lodestar of \$180,570. I am familiar with the billing rates for attorneys with similar experience, particularly with expertise in matters arising under the Telephone Consumer Protection Act, 47 U.S.C. § 227, *et seq.* and my billing rate and that is reasonable and is consistent with the rates of attorneys of similar experience and qualification. My firm additionally incurred \$1,382 in reasonable and necessary expenses in the litigation, including expert witness charges, deposition charges, travel, mediator fees and court charges.

#### **Qualifications of Counsel**

7. I am a 2010 graduate of Suffolk Law School. In 2010, I was admitted to the Bar in Massachusetts. Since then, I have been admitted to practice before the Federal District Court for the District of Massachusetts, the Northern District of Illinois, the Eastern District of Michigan, the Western District of Wisconsin, the Southern District of Indiana, the First Circuit Court of Appeals, the Seventh Circuit Court of Appeals, and the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals. From time to time, I have appeared in other State and Federal District Courts *pro hac vice*. I am in good standing in every court to which I am admitted to practice.

8. I was an associate at Broderick Law, P.C. in Boston, Massachusetts from 2010 through 2016.

9. I was a partner at Broderick & Paronich, P.C. in Boston, Massachusetts from 2016 through 2019.

10. In 2019, I started Paronich Law, P.C., focused on protecting consumers in class action lawsuits.

11. I have been appointed class counsel in more than 35 TCPA cases, including the following:

- i. Desai and Charvat v. ADT Security Services, Inc., USDC, N.D. Ill., 11-CV-1925, a TCPA class settlement of \$15,000,000 granted final approval on June 21, 2013.
- ii. Jay Clogg Realty Group, Inc. v. Burger King Corporation, USDC, D. Md., 13-cv-00662, a TCPA class settlement of \$8,500,000 granted final approval on April 15, 2015.
- iii. Charvat v. AEP Energy, Inc., USDC, N.D. Ill., 1:14-cv-03121, a TCPA class settlement of \$6,000,000 granted final approval on September 28, 2015.
- iv. Bull v. US Coachways, Inc., USDC, N.D. Ill., 1:14-cv-05789, a TCPA class settlement finally approved on November 11, 2016 with an agreement for judgment in the amount of \$49,932,375 and an assignment of rights against defendant's insurance carrier.
- v. Smith v. State Farm Mut. Auto. Ins. Co., et. al., USDC, N.D. Ill., 1:13-cv-02018, a TCPA class settlement of \$7,000,000.00 granted final approval on December 8, 2016.
- vi. Mey v. Frontier Communications Corporation, USDC, D. Conn., 3:13-cv-1191-MPS, a TCPA class settlement of \$11,000,000 granted final approval on June 2, 2017.
- vii. Heidarpour v. Central Payment Co., USDC, M.D. Ga., 15-cv-139, a TCPA class settlement of \$6,500,000 granted final approval on May 4, 2017.
- viii. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Birch Communications, Inc., USDC, N.D. Ga., 1:15-CV-03562-AT, a TCPA class settlement of \$12,000,000 granted final approval on December 14, 2017.
- ix. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Pivotal Payments, Inc., USDC, N.D. Cal., 3:16-cv-05486-JCS, a TCPA class settlement of \$9,000,000 granted final approval on October 15, 2018.

- x. In re Monitronics International, Inc., USDC, N.D.W. Va., 1:13-md-02493-JPB-JES, a TCPA class settlement of \$28,000,000 granted final approval on June 12, 2018.
- xi. Thomas Krakauer v. Dish Network, L.L.C., USDC, M.D.N.C., 1:14-CV-333 on September 9, 2015. Following a contested class certification motion, this case went to trial in January of 2017 returning a verdict of \$20,446,400. On May 22, 2017, this amount was trebled by the Court after finding that Dish Network’s violations were “willful or knowing”, for a revised damages award of \$61,339,200. (Dkt. No. 338). The Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals unanimously affirmed the judgment in May of 2019. *Krakauer v. Dish Network, L.L.C.*, 925 F.3d 643 (4th Cir. 2019). The United States Supreme Court rejected *certiorari* of this matter in December of 2019. *See DISH Network L.L.C. v. Krakauer*, 140 S. Ct. 676 (2019).
- xii. Abante Rooter and Plumbing, Inc. v. Alarm.com Incorporated, et. al., USDC, N.D. Cal., 4:15-cv-06314-YGR, a TCPA class settlement of \$28,000,000 granted final approval on August 13, 2019.
- xiii. Charvat v. Carnival Corporation & PLC, et. al., USDC, N.D. Ill., 1:13-cv-00042, a TCPA class settlement of \$12,500,000 granted final approval in April of 2020.
- xiv. Loftus v. Sunrun, Inc., USDC, N.D. Cal., 3:19-cv-1608, a TCPA class settlement of \$5,500,000 granted final approval on May 11, 2021.
- xv. Murray, et. al. v. Grocery Delivery E-Services USA Inc. d/b/a HelloFresh, D. MA., Civil Action no. 19-cv-12608, a TCPA class settlement of \$14,000,000 granted final approval on October 15, 2021.
- xvi. Perrong v. Orbit Energy & Power, LLC, E.D. PA., Civil Action No. 21-cv-777, a TCPA class settlement of \$6,000,000 granted preliminary approval on March 7, 2022.

PURSUANT TO 28 U.S.C. § 1746, I DECLARE SIGNED UNDER PENALTY OF PERJURY OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA THAT THE FOREGOING IS TRUE AND CORRECT EXECUTED THIS THIS 22nd DAY OF JUNE, 2023, IN THE COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS.

/s/ Anthony I. Paronich  
Anthony I. Paronich